

2014 Graduate Student Conference on Byzantine Studies

February 27–March 1, 2014

Maliotis Cultural Center
Hellenic College Holy Cross
50 Goddard Avenue
Brookline, MA 02445

Organizing Committee: Brandie Ratliff, Director, Mary Jaharis Center for Byzantine Art and Culture, Hellenic College Holy Cross, Dr. James C. Skedros, Michael G. and Anastasia Cantonis Professor of Byzantine Studies and Professor of Early Christianity, Hellenic College Holy Cross, and The Very Reverend Dr. Joachim Cotsonis, Director, Archbishop Iakovos Library and Learning Resource Center, Hellenic College Holy Cross

Support comes from the Mary Jaharis Center for Byzantine Art and Culture and the Michael G. and Anastasia Cantonis Chair of Byzantine Studies

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 27

10:00–11:15 Registration (Maliotis Cultural Center)

11:30–1:00 **SESSION 1 (DISSERTATION REPORTS)**

From 'kalimah' to 'the logos' – Transformation of Knowledge exemplified at the Byzantine Translation of the Quran (8/9th century CE)

Manolis Ulbricht, Freie Universität Berlin, SFB 980, TP A05

Greek Teachers, Latin Speakers: Linguistic and Conceptual Mediterraneanism in Ibn Hazm

A. David Owen, Harvard University, Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations

Framing the Holy: Frames, Covers, and Rims on Byzantine Icons

Betsy Moss, University of Toronto, Department of Art

1:15–2:45 **SESSION 2**

Edge of an Empire: Religion, Politics, and the mosaics of the Basilica of San Vitale

Elena Gittleman, Southern Methodist University, Meadows School of the Arts, Art History

Toward an Understanding of Violence in Byzantium, c. 726-1204

Jake C. Ransohoff, Harvard University, History Department

The background of the political approach of the Byzantine Church & the Ottomans in 14thc.

Konstantinos Kouvaras, University of Athens, History and Archaeology

3:00–4:30 **SESSION 3**

“Old Wine in New Bottles?:” Gregorios Palamas’ Logos on St Peter of Athos (BHG 1506)

Mihail Mitrea, Central European University, Department of Medieval Studies

‘Jesus, Make Sweet My Heart:’ the Affective Language of Hesychast Piety

Tikhon Pino, Holy Cross Greek Orthodox School of Theology

Litigating the Divine Light: Palamas as a Lawyer in the Second Triad

Jennifer M. Jamer, Fordham University, Department of Theology

4:45–6:15

SESSION 4

Reading the Program: A Reassessment of the Tokalı Kilise Donor Inscription

Anna Marie Sitz, University of Pennsylvania, Department of the History of Art

Icons and Naturalism: The Effect of Naturalism and Living Image Response on the Sacred Aura of Madonna and Child Icons During the Renaissance

Jessica Orzulak, University of California, Riverside, History of Art Department

The Vibrant Epitaphios: The Material Agency of the Unseen in Byzantine Christian Holy Week Services

Justin Rose, University of California, Riverside, Department of Religious Studies

FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 28

7:30–8:15

Breakfast (Maliotis Cultural Center)

8:30–10:00

SESSION 5 (DISSERTATION REPORTS)

Rising Above the Faithful: Monumental Ceiling Crosses in Byzantine Cappadocia

Alice Lynn McMichael, The Graduate Center, CUNY, Art History

Civic Devotion to the Mother of God in Late Antique Constantinople: Liturgy, Music, Memory, and Topography in the History of a City

Richard Barrett, Indiana University-Bloomington, Department of History

Sing, Choirs of Angels! Musical Angels in S. Maria Novella and S. Croce, Florence

Amy Gillette, Temple University, Department of Art History

10:15–11:45

SESSION 6

Καὶ τὸ φῶς ἐν τῇ σκοτίᾳ φαίνει: Color in Byzantine Gospel Lectionaries

Joseph R. Kopta, Temple University, Department of Art History

A Personal Message from Patriarch Photios to Emperor Basil I in the Paris Gregory

Courtney Tomaselli, Harvard University, Department of the History of Art and Architecture

Vaticanus Graecus 752 and the Schism of 1054

Kelsey Eldridge, University of Washington, School of Art, Division of Art History

11:45–12:45 Lunch (Condakes Cafeteria)

1:00–2:30 **SESSION 7**

Deification according to Maximos the Confessor and the Transcendence of Aristotelian Metaphysics

L. Joshua Salés, Fordham University, Department of Theology

Greek Clerical Appearance in anti-Byzantine Latin Polemic, late 11th-12th Centuries

Nicolas Kamas, University of Notre Dame, Medieval Institute

An Evaluation of the Letters of George-Gennadios Scholarios to Members of the Ruling Elite in Fifteenth-Century Peloponnese

A. Kerim Kartal, Queen's University, Department of History

2:45–4:15 **SESSION 8**

Encountering the Face: The Mandylion at the Church of the Panagia tou Arakou at Lagoudhera

Leah Marangos, Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey, Department of Art History

Physical and Spiritual Protection at the Monastery of St. Katherine, Sinai

Kaelin M. Jewell, Temple University, Department of Art History

The Infirmary and Space for the Ill in the Monasteries of Late Antiquity

Tyler Wolford, Koç University, Department of Archaeology and History of Art

6:00–6:45 Reception (Maliotis Cultural Center)

7:00–8:00 **KEYNOTE ADDRESS**

The Sinai Palimpsest Project: Piercing the Mists of Time

Fr. Justin Sinaites, Librarian of the Sacred and Imperial Monastery of the God-Trodden Mount of Sinai

SATURDAY, MARCH 1

7:30–8:15 Breakfast (Maliotis Cultural Center)

8:30–10:30

SESSION 9

Jewelry and the Morality of Adornment in the Medieval Eastern Mediterranean

Elizabeth Williams, NYU, Institute of Fine Arts

Recalling the Female “Intellectual” in Sarcophagi Narrative Scenes of the Long Late Antiquity

Alzahraa K. Ahmed, NYU, Institute of Fine Arts

Byzantine Models in Lombard Jewellery: Materials from Castel Trosino and Nocera Umbra (Italy)

Valentina De Pasca, University of Milan, Early Medieval Archaeology

Painting Cultural Scars: A Look at Post-Byzantine Paintings through the Trauma Model

Mateusz J. Ferens, University of California, Riverside, History of Art Department

10:45–12:15

SESSION 10

Imperial Competition and Cultural Constructs: The Empires of Nicaea and Thessaloniki in the Late Byzantine World

Grant Schrama, Queen’s University, Department of History

Revisiting Iconoclasm: Figural Imagery as an Instrument of State Politics in Byzantium and Early Islam

Eric Medawar, University of Connecticut, Classics and Ancient Mediterranean Studies

Akritas or Emperor? An Examination of the Military Career of John Tzimiskes

James Gilmer, Cardiff University, Department of History

12:15

Boxed lunches available for pick up beginning at 12:15 (Maliotis Cultural Center)

12:30–2:15

SESSION 11

The Byzantine Nachleben of Aeschylus

Matthew Keil, Fordham University, Department of Classics

The Interpretation of John 19:34 in Late Antique Byzantine Thought

Jonathan M. Reck, Dallas Theological Seminary, New Testament Studies

Maximus Planudes and Boethius' Byzantine reception: Βίος Βοηθίου

Paul A. Brazinski, The Catholic University of America, School of Theology and Religious Studies, Church History

~End of the 2014 Graduate Student Conference on Byzantine Studies~

From 'kalimah' to 'the logos' – Transformation of Knowledge exemplified at the Byzantine Translation of the Quran (8/9th century CE)

Manolis Ulbricht, Freie Universität Berlin, SFB 980, TP A05

My PhD project aims to examine the very first translation of the Quran into a European language, which is a Greek translation from the 8/9th century CE, and to compare it with the original Arabic text. The translation by an anonymous author, while generally very accurate, contains some textually subtle, but theologically highly important differences with respect to the Arabic text. It seems to be the result of a Christian hermeneutical reading of the Quran. For example, the Quranic terminus „*kalimah*“ („word“) is always translated as „*ho logos*“/ «*ὁ λόγος*» („the word“) and implies therefore significant Christological meanings which are not mentioned within the Quran.

This translation was used in a Byzantine polemic against Islam (the so-called “Refutation of the Quran” – referred to in the following as *Anatropē*) by Nicetas of Byzantium (9th c. CE). Additionally, and beyond the comparison, I shall analyze the use of the Greek translation in Nicetas’ *Anatropē*, which is the only source of the translation of the Quran (Vat. gr. 681). In a final section, I will contextualize the *Anatropē* with Nicetas’ other apologetic works against the Catholics and the Armenians. I do this in order to determine whether Nicetas considered Islam a Christian heresy – as did other apologetic writers before him like John of Damascus (7th/8th c. CE) and Theodor Abū Qurrah (8/9th c. CE) – or if he understood it as a new, independent religion – being one of the first Byzantine writers against Islam doing like this.

In volume one (approx. 200 pages) of my PhD thesis, I am preparing a critical edition of the Quran quotations of the Vat. gr. 681 and a Greek-Arabic synopsis of those fragments; they are classified into three categories: literal quotations, free quotations, and allusions. Volume two will be an analysis and commentary of the Greek Quran fragments (approx. 150 pages). The last volume consists of a Greek-Arabic glossary of all terms used within the translation and a Greek-Arabic concordance (approx. 400 pages).

My work has to be seen within the framework of the Christian-Muslim apologetic and polemic discourses of the time shortly after the rise of Islam. The research project is related to Quranic studies and it characterizes one of the most important, albeit little known Byzantine polemicists. Nicetas is one of the first who uses the Quran itself for the refutation of the Islamic faith. His attempt had a vast influence on later Byzantine and even mediaeval European apologetic writing against Islam. Nicetas lived during the ‘Macedonian Renaissance’ in Constantinople in a period of thriving military and intellectual activities and a climate of intercultural exchange with the Muslim ‘Abbāsid caliphate. My research will help to shed light on the ‘Macedonian Renaissance’, its intellectual life and external relations with the Arab neighbors.

Greek Teachers, Latin Speakers: Linguistic and Conceptual Mediterraneanism in Ibn Hazm

A. David Owen, Harvard University, Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations

Born in 994 at Cordoba, Ibn Hazm was caliphal vizier like his father. After the Umayyad collapse, his teaching and disputations centered around the maritime Slavic (siqlabi) Kingdom of Denia, until his death in 1064. My dissertation studies Ibn Hazm's contributions to logic, and my research suggests that Ibn Hazm is the first jurist ever to explicitly advocate formal logic for legal education and legal reasoning. His doctrine of logic's utility for attaining certainty and unity of results is at least as Galenic as it is Peripatetic, and is transposed by Ibn Hazm from medicine to law.

By way of establishing Ibn Hazm's sources and intellectual context, and as a novel contribution to Mediterranean intellectual history, I propose a dissertation report in two stages. In the first stage, I will produce a review of existing scholarship, and point to potentially unexploited evidence for contacts between Byzantium and al-Andalus, especially Umayyad Cordoba and siqlabi Mallorca, at the end of the 10th and during the first half of the 11th century. I also hope to find leads for neglected evidence in chronicles such as that of the *Kitab al-Dhayl* by the Melkite historian Yahya Ibn Said al-Antaki (d. 1065), including the unattributed continuation, an important and largely overlooked source (cf. Holmes 2005), especially for Arabo-Byzantine relations. My study aims to uncover new instances of Byzantine-Andalusi cultural continuity and transmission beyond those established. We already know of Byzantine influence on Visigothic law (cf. Zeumer) and on Mozarabic architecture, liturgy, and theology (cf. Presedo Velo). We know still other texts arrived with diplomatic missions between Byzantium and al-Andalus; at least ten are described by the Arab historians through the end of the caliphal period.

In the second stage of my report, I aim to provide an overview of references in Ibn Hazm's extant work to Greek and Latin sources. These include a verse riposte to Nikephoros II Phokas, a treatment of the *Organon*, numerous references to "Latin," and familiarity with Orosius, Isidore, the Justinian-influenced *Lex Visigothorum*, and Galen. (Bihbahani's Persian introduction to our only full translation of the *Taqrib* states that Ibn Hazm must have known Latin and had access to sources unavailable in the Islamic East, cf. id. in bib. pp. 3-4.) My project will further clarify to what extent 10th/11th century Andalus had access to Byzantine sources, or to oral, written, and liturgical substrate remaining in post-Byzantine Iberia. Puig Montada has speculated that this would explain non-Peripatetic material in Ibn Hazm's logic, but no attempt has yet been made to test the claim. Beyond exploiting new sources on Byzantine history, and indicating new areas of Byzantine relations and influence, my project sheds light on the unique reception of late antiquity in al-Andalus, lends greater detail to a neglected chapter of Graeco-Arabic logic, and establishes a neglected dimension of Ibn Hazm's intellectual context.

Framing the Holy: Frames, Covers, and Rims on Byzantine Icons

Betsy Moss, University of Toronto, Department of Art

This dissertation interprets the functions and meanings of precious-metal icon revetments and frames in late Byzantine artistic production and devotional practice through five thematic case studies. It includes a catalogue of over 80 decorated icons, almost doubling the number of examples of Byzantine and Georgian icons published by André Grabar in 1975. The thesis situates the case-study icons within the cultural networks of the Byzantine Empire and its neighbors in the Balkan and Italian peninsulas. Their evident mingling of Byzantine and Western stylistic traditions reveals how some of the revetted icons functioned as vehicles for cultural exchange. Frames and decorative covers on Byzantine icons were deeply entwined with the proliferation of metal decorations on late medieval western altarpieces and devotional panels. Even so, these decorated icons are inadequately understood within the wider scope of medieval art. Those who are interested in the diverse forms of late Byzantine icons, the connections between Byzantine icons and late medieval panel painting, and the devotional and liturgical uses of icons have a stake in this project.

Kant's *parergon* and Derrida's constructed frame are inadequate explanations of how icon frames and revetments worked philosophically and, more importantly, theologically. Neither theory is able to explain either why these additions to many icons were developed or how the new revetments augmented the icons' meanings and functions. These revetments were part of an "ornamental turn" in the late Byzantine period, a stylistic shift in Byzantine art that included an increased use of luxury materials and an expansion of surfaces treated with a range of decorative motifs. The proliferation of decoration on icons was part of a system of meaning—a language—that mediated divine presence, agency, and activity through the icon. Further, it muddied the distinction between icon and prototype by treating the icon as more than a strict likeness of its prototype. For example, several inscriptions on silver-gilt revetments describe themselves as gifts to the icon, not to the holy figure represented. As a result, revetments changed the ontological structure of icons. Revetted icons inhabited a space enriched by ornamental language, familiar liturgical feast scenes, and inscribed prayers. They helped viewers apprehend the heavenly realm of the holy figure by incorporating the visual language of paradise and prayer onto and into the icon itself. The experience of the spiritual realm is sometimes exhibited in the significant physical damage that icons suffered, resulting from various acts of veneration; many icons damaged in this way would be repainted and re-gilded, and then covered with a revetment. In other cases, icons were covered with revetments almost immediately after they were first painted, as if to imply that this icon already bore the marks of damage from veneration. Each chapter engages a theme that is central to the current practice of art history: image and text relationships, material agency, ornament, display, and patronage. I balance the theoretically driven analysis of each chapter's theme with focused attention to the case-study icon.

Edge of an Empire: Religion, Politics, and the mosaics of the Basilica of San Vitale

Elena Gittleman, Southern Methodist University, Meadows School of the Arts, Art History

The Basilica of San Vitale and its mosaics, begun by a Catholic Bishop in 526 under Ostrogothic Arian rule, and completed after Justinian's reconquest of the city in 547, provide a fascinating insight into a world at a crossroads. The mosaic program in San Vitale, which brings together Biblical and theophanic imagery with political portraiture, creates a liminal space between the sacred and profane, in which the portraits of Justinian and Theodora stand in the symbolic center. I argue that this in-between space is mirrored in Ravenna's ambiguous imperial standing. The city was on the edge between importance and insignificance that only the blessing and support of Justinian could stabilize. This inter-disciplinary paper, grounded in theological, historical and physical sources, analyses primary documents and San Vitale's mosaic decoration to question the purpose and place of the Basilica within Justinian's program of *renovatio imperii*.

Scholars such as Kitzinger, MacCormack, and Maguire have astutely stated that the mosaics at San Vitale link Christ and Justinian in universal triumph. However, I argue that more importantly, these mosaics, by embracing and visually presenting the whole of Justinian's imperial rhetoric, were created in an attempt to reconnect Ravenna to the Empire.

According to the imperial history recorded by Procopius, Justinian embarked upon a program of *renovatio imperii*—an attempt to recreate the old Imperial Roman Empire. While Justinian did seek to recapture Italy, he did not deem Ravenna, once a great Roman and Ostrogothic city, worthy of attention. Instead, he focused his military power on Rome. After gaining unstable control of Rome in 536, Justinian immediately recalled his troops to Constantinople to fight off the encroaching Persian Empire, all but abandoning Italy. Ravenna and other Italian sites are conspicuously absent from Procopius's *Buildings*, an otherwise informative record of Justinian's important building projects throughout his newly won territories following the Nika Riots of 532. Why then was the Basilica of San Vitale in Ravenna decorated with such explicit, and expensive imperial imagery?

As the rebuilding of the Hagia Sophia and Constantinople post-Nika Riot demonstrate, the purpose of Justinian's building projects and imperial expansion was to regain a firm control of his Empire, to claim a close relationship with God, to attest that God was his partner in all of his endeavors and that Justinian would lead his people to salvation. San Vitale speaks to his intentions in a very powerful way. This paper explores two of the most important strategies used to signal this agenda: the abundance of greenery and nature motifs, and religious imagery, which embody the rhetoric of imperial renewal.

In Ravenna, at least half of Justinian's goal was accomplished—without ever setting foot in the city, his image and messages were successfully propagated. Nevertheless, Justinian did not live up to his promises—he failed and abandoned the Catholics of Ravenna. Thus, the Basilica of San Vitale, in what once was the proud center of the most important realm in the world, suddenly became a failed monument on the edge of the Empire.

Toward an Understanding of Violence in Byzantium, c. 726-1204

Jake C. Ransohoff, Harvard University, History Department

The present paper seeks an answer to the questions: what was violence in Byzantium, and how did Byzantine observers discriminate between different forms of violence? At first glance, the problem of defining Byzantine violence may seem more apparent than real: certainly “Homo Byzantinus” viewed murder, mutilation, and physical abuse as acts of violence, as intuition suggests and court records, hagiography, and popular literature all confirm. Yet we cannot simply say that we know violence in Byzantium when we see it and get on with the “real business” of description. Consider, for instance, the *Chronicle* of Theophanes the Confessor, which praises the Empress Irene for her justice in blinding her own son, but described those emperors who defiled icons (or merely removed them from holy spaces) as performing violence comparable to the Crucifixion. Nearly three centuries later, the Byzantine polymath Michael Psellos could write a letter to a deposed emperor congratulating him on the good fortune of his blinding, while his near-contemporary Anna Komnene and her companions shuddered at the humiliating spectacle of a rebel having his beard shorn.

Such examples alert us to the fact, if indeed we need alerting, that Byzantine authors inhabited a conceptual world of violence very different from our own – one that resists attempts to be measured and weighed by degrees of bodily harm. To get a fix on why Byzantine observers responded the way they did to such circumstances, we must therefore attempt to think our way back into Byzantine notions of violence on their own terms, rather than relying on present assumptions about what violence is (and is not) to guide us. I argue that an important first step in this process may be to think of violence in the Byzantine world not as a set of discreet *actions*, but rather as an *effect*. Shifting our focus from the actions of victimizers to the effects of perceived violence on victims and observers allows us to ask different questions of our sources: what made Byzantine men and women cry out in anguish? What made their stomachs turn or their jaws and fists clench? What made them squirm in their chairs? The benefit of these types of questions is that they neither privilege a physical account of violence, nor do they presuppose a distinction between the physical and the psychological. Rather, they allow the cultural competence of Byzantine observers to guide the nature of our conclusions about violence in Byzantium.

Framed in this way, it becomes clear that perceptions of violence in literate Byzantine society were closely associated with the omnipresent but elusive concept of *τάξις*, or “order.” To cut off someone’s hand, or shave off their beard in such a way as to emphasize an inversion of gender norms, or to depart from the accepted norms of a literary genre, or even to move too fast during an imperial ceremony – all of these can be construed as offenses against *τάξις*, as they pervert an ideal of proper order. And the correct response of an educated Byzantine observer to such a breach of *τάξις* – the way one showed that one fully embodied the ideals of Byzantine high society – was a performative display of stress, shock, and pain. Thus a working explanation for how Byzantine observers classified and communicated an action as violent is as the process

whereby something that possesses *τάξις* falls into *ἀταξία*, or disorder. To be sure, this generalization fits certain groups and periods better than others, and we must be sensitive to how social conventions changed over space and time. But through a series of focused case-studies drawn from legal, historical, and hagiographical literature from the period between Iconoclasm and the Fourth Crusade, this paper argues that, by thinking about violence in Byzantium as a process of perceived disorder, we can begin to get a fix on how and why the Byzantines themselves – or at least certain socially-competent Byzantines at certain points in time – parsed certain activities as violent.

The background of the political approach of the Byzantine Church & the Ottomans in 14thc.

Konstantinos Kouvaras, University of Athens, History and Archaeology

On 6th of January 1454 the Ottoman sultan Mehmed II, just seven months after the fall of Constantinople, taking into consideration the delicate political balances of his empire under formation, decided to reconstitute the Patriarchate of Constantinople, inaugurating a new era in which the Church would play an influential role in the political affairs of the Ottoman Empire up to the beginning of 20th century.

Therefore it presents particular interest to investigate the foundations of this relationship by examining the effort of political approach which was likely attempted between the Church and the Ottomans the last century before the Fall. In this context, the first task would be to seek the theoretical background which was constructed in the early phase of this period, i.e. in the mid 14th c., and which enabled the two sides to discover and define a common political ambience for the next decades.

The experience of the Arab conquests the period from 7th to 10th c., and then the Turkish ones from the 11th c., constituted an invaluable deposit for both sides as to whether it was feasible for the Church to be maintained as an institution under the authority of a Muslim state.

In this case, it is very intriguing to examine the eremitic movement of Hesychasm, which even though preexisted from the early Christian period, was rekindled in the mid 14th c. and how through it a group of people, who played an influential role in ecclesiastical and political affairs, didn't attempted simply to reinforce it to ecclesiastical-monastic circles, but also to introduce it to the Christian congregation, including governmental officials with most notable example the emperor John VI Kantakouzenos. All these were shaped in a time of intense distress for the survival henceforth of the malformed Byzantine state amid civil war and with the Ottomans to strengthen and consolidate increasingly their position in the political chessboard.

Consequently the theological and political fermentations in the mid 14th c., between the Church and the Ottomans represent a major turning point in Byzantine history and beyond, since it's the era when the two sides either consciously or not, nevertheless placed the base of the political relationship which would, in the near future, be proved entirely productive for both political components.

“Old Wine in New Bottles?:” Gregorios Palamas’ Logos on St Peter of Athos (BHG 1506)

Mihail Mitrea, Central European University, Department of Medieval Studies

The late Byzantine period witnessed an impressive revival of hagiographical production, characterized especially by the composition and (re)writing (*metaphrasis*) – “old wine in new bottles” as Talbot put it – of *vitae* and *enkomia* of holy men and women from the distant past; in fact, almost eighty percent of the Palaiologan hagiographical production consists of new versions of *vitae* or *enkomia* of saints from earlier centuries. Gregorios Palamas (ca.1294/6–ca.1357/9), an Athonite hieromonk and distinguished theologian of the fourteenth-century Byzantium, ranked as well among those having tried his pen at this genre. The present paper aims to enter the less studied “working room” of the hagiographer Palamas by analyzing the debut of his hagiographical production, namely the *Logos on St Peter of Athos* (BHG 1506). A mysterious character renowned as “the first monk of the Holy Mountain,” Peter the Athonite seems to have been a hermit living for more than five decades on Athos in the beginning of the tenth century, in the period prior to the foundation of the great coenobitic monasteries. The paper traces the way in which Palamas reused, changed, supplemented, and departed from his source(s) – especially the tenth/eleventh-century *Life of Peter* (BHG 1505) by a certain Athonite monk Nicholas – while (re)writing this *vita*. Following a discussion of the dissemination and textual tradition of the tenth/eleventh-century text, an analysis of style, register and intertextuality is employed in order to isolate the innovations that Palamas has embedded in his work. Furthermore, the paper addresses some of the likely reasons that triggered Palamas’ choice of subject, the context surrounding the (re)writing of this *vita*, as well as its intended audience (most likely a monastic/Athonite ‘theatron’) and effect.

‘Jesus, Make Sweet My Heart:’ the Affective Language of Hesychast Piety

Tikhon Pino, Holy Cross Greek Orthodox School of Theology

The Hesychast movement of the late Byzantine period, consolidated by Gregory Palamas and his followers, is characterized by a maximalist apophaticism that culminates in the transcendence of divine being itself. In its ascetical theology, it endorsed a spirituality whereby the ultimate aim of prayer and contemplation was the transcendence not only of sensation but even of cognition. For this reason, the aims of Hesychast spirituality have often been contrasted with the mysticism of the medieval West. The latter, which helped engender the Baroque piety of the Counter-Reformation, is frequently presented as antithetical to the Orthodox ascetical tradition, which rejected imaginative meditation and related forms of affective prayer. Since the time of Evagrius and Maximos the Confessor, the pure, imageless prayer of the intellect (νοῦς) has been the goal of Greek spirituality, and the writers of late Byzantium maintained this exclusive vision of the contemplative life.

Yet in spite of such antinomy, the ascetical writings of the Christian East are replete with affective language, emphasizing especially, in addition to the familiar language of the heart, the concept of “sweetness.” The sweetness of contemplation, of tears, and especially of Christ himself, figure prominently in the Hesychast articulation of pure prayer. In this paper I seek to elucidate the theory of spiritual sweetness as elaborated in the authors of the late Palaiologan period, tracing its roots more deeply into the patristic corpus. In addition to mapping a complex tradition of affective language, and thus showing greater parallels with the West than are usually supposed, I argue that the concept of sweetness in late Byzantine spirituality is a direct product of Hesychast anthropology and that Palamite psychology, along with its understanding of materiality and body, are responsible for a unique appropriation of sensory language in a way that is neither strictly emotive nor reductively metaphorical.

Litigating the Divine Light: Palamas as a Lawyer in the Second Triad

Jennifer M. Jamer, Fordham University, Department of Theology

While Gregory Palamas is best known for his theological acumen — namely, his articulation of the essence-energies distinction and his thoughts on the eventual deification of human persons — his skills as a rhetorician were equally impressive and they significantly contributed to the success of his monastic and theological programs. A careful reading of the *Triads*, a sophisticated set of responses to his critics composed between 1338 and 1340, reveals that Palamas is self-consciously rhetorically constructing himself as a lawyer in the second *Triad*. This section was composed after Barlaam of Calabria's *Against the Messalians* and predates the 1341 council and the *Hagioretic Tome*. In this paper, I contend that Palamas' self-presentation as a lawyer serves as a potential interpretive key to this section of the *Triads*. If Palamas is speaking as a lawyer in this section, then his goal is the presentation of a rhetorically persuasive case. This case would be based on precedents, compelling arguments, and standard rhetorical categorizations. If Palamas is presenting a "legal" argument rather than a theological one, then the language and concepts in this *Triad* must not be taken at face value, as they have been in previous scholarship, but read critically with an eye towards how they fit into a wider and older rhetorical tradition. In this paper, I will take two rhetorical concerns and two theological concerns and analyze how these concerns fit into wider rhetorical patterns. The two rhetorical concerns I will address are Palamas' quotations of Barlaam of Calabria's *Against the Messalians* and the terminology which Palamas deploys to describe Barlaam. The two theological concerns handled in this paper are the relationship between philosophical wisdom and theological wisdom and the possibilities of the human mind. These four categories have been chosen not only because they are well represented in analogous texts, making them useful for comparison, but also because they have played a role in the popular conceptualization of the controversy. In my analysis of this issue, I aim to 1.) present a rhetorical analysis of the text and 2.) raise suggestions about possible distinctive elements of the first phase of the hesychast debate which have been overshadowed by generic tropes.

Reading the Program: A Reassessment of the Tokalı Kilise Donor Inscription

Anna Marie Sitz, University of Pennsylvania, Department of the History of Art

“Constantine beautifies the new church with revered images,” the painted inscription in the Tokalı Kilise tells viewers. Both scholars and tourists have been impressed by the beautiful scenes painted by a Constantinopolitan workshop in the rock-cut Cappadocian church in the mid-tenth century. Scenes from the Life of Christ culminate in a Crucifixion in the central apse of the “New Church.” The fragmentary donor inscription runs around the cornice of the rock-cut church: it mentions the donor, his act of decorating the church, and lists scenes from the Gospel narrative. Since the inscription’s publication by Jerphanion in 1925, scholars have accepted his restoration of the missing segments as well as his overall interpretation that the inscription is “incorrect” because the scenes mentioned do not match the scenes actually painted in the church. This interpretation is followed by Epstein in her monograph on the Tokalı Kilise; she suggested that the cornice inscription was derived from a literary prototype or commissioned from a writer living elsewhere who had not been informed of the exact scenes to be included in the program.

My paper, however, argues that we can begin to understand the painted inscription only when we move beyond assumptions of its “inaccuracy” at describing the surrounding scenes. First, I examine each part of the inscription as it has been transcribed, emended, and translated by previous scholars. This investigation suggests several points where the current reading of the inscription could be revised. While these revisions are as tentative as the original restorations, the possibility of alternative readings illustrates the potential pitfalls of accepting a frequently published restoration as the “original” text itself. Furthermore, I argue that the scholarly assumption that the inscription was intended to list the scenes portrayed in the church also needs to be revised. The Tokalı Kilise inscription should be read as an enhancement to, rather than a description of, the surrounding decorative program.

There are numerous points of contact between the inscription and the painted scenes: most notably, the frequent use of words related to “running” in the inscription may correspond with the energetic action poses of the painted figures. As a whole, however, the *dipinto* is far from a programmatic list of the scenes surrounding it. This is not surprising, since it is a piece of writing about art. As various scholars have noted, Byzantine *ekphrases* that purport to describe a work of art take many liberties in their descriptions. “Accuracy” was not a high priority.

By reconsidering both the text and the meaning of the Tokalı Kilise donor inscription, this paper takes the inscription seriously as a part of the overall decorative program, rather than a mistaken list of scenes. Doing so enhances our understanding of one of the best preserved tenth century Byzantine church programs and contributes to the discussion of texts and images.

Icons and Naturalism: The Effect of Naturalism and Living Image Response on the Sacred Aura of Madonna and Child Icons During the Renaissance

Jessica Orzulak, University of California, Riverside, History of Art Department

The imagery of Madonna and Child icons developed in the Byzantine Empire enacted a particular agency and presence for worshippers and viewers that continued into the Italian Renaissance. The shift towards naturalism in religious painting in the early 1400's is indicative of complex social and cultural events in Renaissance Italy. In particular, images of the Madonna and Child are representative of competing religious, political and societal imperatives in which the depiction of the female body presented distinctly problematic challenges within social discourse. Additionally there was a new demand for what we might call 'art' and an expectation of lifelikeness and presence in painting and sculpture depicting the human body. Aesthetically and theoretically lifelikeness is often related to the experience of the living presence response, that experience in which an encounter with an image or object engenders the beholder to be affected emotionally and psychologically as if they were being confronted with a living being. The scholarship exploring this response most often discusses it in relation to secular art, ignoring the well-documented function of the religious icon developed in Byzantium as being *alive* and capable of agency. Icon paintings were a functional part of society for centuries that were prayed to, paraded around cities, and given gifts. They were socially and religiously treated as if they were truly the surrogates for the persons they represented, a mediating device that the spirit of the person could embody and do works through. However, in Renaissance Italy, advancements in science, medicine, and technical ability and a preference for naturalism in images clashed with the tradition of painting holy icons and the two functionally separate practices of making religious images and secular 'art' could not remain two homogeneous entities. The separation between the two types of images begins to dissolve and activates a collapse of the religious icons' functionality and aura.

The presence of a sacred aura in Madonna and Child icons was agitated by numerous and simultaneous disruptions in imagery, politics, and social discourses, that resulted in their efficacy being effectively dissolved and their presence transformed and complicated. Competing experiences arising from discourses of sexual desire, breast-feeding, idealism, and a trend towards naturalism in images disrupted the religious presence and agency surrounding Madonna and Child icons. As cultural ideals transformed, aligning with the secular rather than the religious and began to favor images that appeared naturalized but ideal the living image presence experienced in secular art destabilized religious presence, eventually consuming its divine agency and leaving it with a more elementally symbolic presence. In the Renaissance the preference for naturalism lead to a reaction to images of the Virgin becoming fundamentally problematic within the mind of the viewer. Slippages between the sacred and the profane altered the image and Madonna and Child icons became works of art rather than works of divinity.

The Vibrant Epitaphios: The Material Agency of the Unseen in Byzantine Christian Holy Week Services

Justin Rose, University of California, Riverside, Department of Religious Studies

In contemporary Byzantine Christian praxis, the *Epitaphios* plays a central role in the unfolding drama of Holy Week services commemorating the death and resurrection of Christ. In fact, an entire prayer service grew up around this richly embroidered tapestry. In performance, the *Epitaphios* is partially or entirely obscured from the participants' view during the whole cycle of crucifixion and burial ceremonies. Even though the worshippers only rarely make clear visual contact with this depiction of Jesus entombed, the long established embroidered iconographic program must be present in the midst of the assembly.

This paper explores the material agency of the *Epitaphios* during Good Friday services especially when it is nearly or completely unseen. Using Jane Bennett's *Vibrant Materiality* and Warren Woodfin's *The Embodied Icon* as starting points, the paper considers the agency of the *Epitaphios* as an active and essential participant in the *assemblage* of the Holy Week worshippers gathered in a liturgical setting.

Rising Above the Faithful: Monumental Ceiling Crosses in Byzantine Cappadocia

Alice Lynn McMichael, The Graduate Center, CUNY, Art History

This dissertation examines monumental ceiling crosses, architectural decorations found throughout Byzantine Cappadocia (now part of central Turkey). Ceiling cross paintings and reliefs from the 6-10th centuries dominate the ceilings of at least twenty churches. An example of a monumental ceiling cross is in the 10th-century church of St. Basil where the Byzantine Christian would have been surrounded by vibrant floor-to-ceiling wall paintings that pulled his attention upward. On the low ceiling, just above arm's reach, he was confronted with a monumental yellow cross, painted to look as if it were jeweled, infusing the interior with the aura of the holy cross. Following its massive shape, his gaze was directed toward the apse where the Eucharist was celebrated.

Art historians have described ceiling crosses as depictions of liturgical crosses, but this is speculative because there are virtually no extant Cappadocian liturgical objects or texts. Scholars have not yet integrated them into the larger context of sacral space and liturgical function. My dissertation elucidates ceiling crosses through analysis of and comparison to existing liturgical objects in museum collections. I assert that many ceiling crosses were a signal of several types of three-dimensional objects used on the altars below, including liturgical crosses, gospel covers, and reliquaries. As such, their placement on the ceiling is a visual expression of both regional Cappadocian liturgical practices and the Cult of the Cross in Byzantium. This enables us to incorporate Cappadocian material culture studies into a wider conversation about relationships between architecture and liturgy, enriching it by including the bustling but often-neglected province of Cappadocia.

In a liturgical context, the ceiling cross symbolizes Christianity, refers to the eucharist below, and also carries the “figurative meaning” of Christ himself, an image with the agency of a miracle-working relic, capable of activating surrounding space. Similar images in the west have been examined by scholars who address the ancient perception of both the cross and gems as metaphors for light. By using their criteria to discuss “gemmed” ceiling crosses and relic theory in Cappadocia, I insert these cross images into the broader field of medieval devotional studies.

**Civic Devotion to the Mother of God in Late Antique Constantinople: Liturgy, Music,
Memory, and Topography in the History of a City**

Richard Barrett, Indiana University-Bloomington, Department of History

The late antique (c. 431 — c. 700) cult of the Virgin Mary, and its flourishing in the Byzantine Empire, the Eastern half of the Roman world, represents a unique interdisciplinary opportunity to study urban history. Following the dogmatization of the Virgin's title of *Theotokos* "Birthgiver of God" at the Council of Ephesus in 431, throughout the Roman world there is an initial impulse to express conciliar orthodoxy in very Roman terms — that is, to build physical monuments, such as Santa Maria Maggiore in Rome and the Kathismata church in Jerusalem. By contrast, Marian devotions in New Rome — Constantinople — are expressed in very Constantinopolitan terms; a *creative* impulse gives rise to the composition of hymnody and the development of liturgical practices, such as the so-called *Akathistos*, a lengthy theological discourse in sung verse, composed immediately following the Council. Church construction in Constantinople then follows the development of the devotional practices. Throughout the sixth century, these liturgical practices continue to develop with Justinian's project of reuniting the Roman Empire; the sung theological homilies known as *kontakia*, most notably those of Romanos the Melodist, intertwine public cathedral worship with imperial ceremony. History intervenes in the development of public Byzantine Marian devotions, however. The successful defense of the city from the Persians and Avars in 626, claimed by the contemporary sources to be the result of physical intervention by the Mother of God herself, was represented in the historiographical tradition by the relics, the image, and the physical presence of the Mother of God. The particular historical significance impressed upon these objects and their performative context changed the Virgin Mary from an exalted figure passively defined largely in terms of her Son and becomes a historical actor in her own right with her own interests — namely, the well-being of the city of Constantinople. In other words, the 626 siege and its aftermath changed the late antique cult of the Virgin into the Middle Byzantine cult of the Virgin, in which only those late antique elements are preserved that were directly related to the events of 626. Normative public ritual reacts descriptively to historical circumstances, in other words. This project will show that the association of the Virgin with the victory of 626 happened because of the precedent and context of public ritual devotion to the Virgin Mary in Constantinople, unique in its creative particulars in the late antique Roman world.

Sing, Choirs of Angels! Musical Angels in S. Maria Novella and S. Croce, Florence
Amy Gillette, Temple University, Department of Art History

I would be very grateful to present and discuss the Byzantine dimensions of my dissertation, in which I identify and interpret the ways in which images of angel musicians functioned as spiritual exemplars in the Dominican and Franciscan churches of S. Maria Novella (begun 1279) and S. Croce (begun 1294), both in Florence. I have found that these angels directed the friars' vision, worship, and self-comportment as an image of God; and gave themselves to their audiences through what I believe to be groundbreaking interactions of theology, performance, and the devotional power of images. For example, Italian painters had come to embrace the sacred charisma of Byzantine icons after 1204, due to their importation from Constantinople and to their Mendicant use as agents of conversion in the Latin East and at home.¹ New pastoral regulations simultaneously led the Italian images to promote the Scholastic ideal of ethical mimesis, already embodied by Gothic art farther north.² Moreover, such authors as Bonaventure and Dante had likewise merged Byzantine and Scholastic ideas in order to intensify the roles of angels and music in guiding spiritual ascent.³

My report would address the intersections of angelology and the devotional power of images as instantiated in S. Croce's exuberant Baroncelli altarpiece and S. Maria Novella's rainbow-colored *Paradiso* fresco. Significantly, Aquinas and Bonaventure upheld the fundamental theology and functions of the Pseudo-Dionysian angelic hierarchy as well as cited John of Damascus's dictum that the honor paid to images accrued to their prototypes, even though Western images never gained a direct stake in theological truth.⁴ Yet by way of approximation, Aquinas and Bonaventure also updated the roles of angelic imagery as ethical and performative indices for friars vis-à-vis the workings of *affectus*—an Aristotelian principle whereby emotion opened the door to cognition and thence to divine union—as much as to the hagiographies of SS. Dominic and Francis.⁵ Further, the same authors, Dante, the contemporary Dominican and Franciscan liturgies, and modern scholars such as Emanuel Winteritz and Oliver Huck all indicate that representation of instrumentalist angels exerted a special devotional

¹ Derbes, Anne, and Amy Neff, "Italy, the Mendicant Orders, and the Byzantine Sphere," *Byzantium: Faith & Power (1260-1557)*, exh. cat., ed. Helen Evans (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2004): 448-61.

² Cf. Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae*, II-II, 145, 2. "Spiritual beauty consists in actions that are well-proportioned with the spiritual light of reason."

³ Discussed in: Derbes and Neff 2004; Paul Binski, *Becket's Crown: Art and Imagination in Gothic England, 1170-1300* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2004); Joanna Cannon, "Giotto and Art for the Friars: Revolutions Spiritual and Artistic," *The Cambridge Companion to Giotto*, ed. Anne Derbes and Mark Sandona (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004): 108-32; and Donal Cooper, "Projecting Presence: The Monumental Cross in the Italian Church Interior," *Presence: The Inherence of the Prototype within the Image and Other Objects*, ed. Robert Maniura and Rupert Shephard (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006): 47-57.

⁴ Joanna Cannon and Donal Cooper have led the way in demonstrating that Aquinas and Bonaventure's writings had actual agency on the image programs of S. Maria Novella and S. Croce.

⁵ David Keck, *Angels & Angelology in the Middle Ages* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998).

charge.⁶ It seems that because liturgical chant explicitly imitated the angelic doxology, singing and instrumentalist angels came to model the actions, symbols, and collective joy for the Mendicant clergy celebrating it on earth.⁷ On the one hand, this new mode of signification rendered angelic beatitude as visible in painting as it had become audible in polyphonic music, expressing this meaning with smiles, gestures, musical instruments, and the colors of the angels themselves as well as their robes and garlands.⁸ On the other, it brought a charge to greater empathic interaction, to the effect that musical angels ask their audience to assume their heavenly cheerfulness, as set out in the antiphons and Mass and also in the Neoplatonic hierarchies that had so profoundly shaped both Orthodox and Latin angelologies. All in all, it seems that images of music-making angels forged existential links with heaven that very nearly approached the Byzantine icon's theological power.

⁶ Oliver Huck, "The Music of the Angels in Fourteenth- and Early Fifteenth-Century Music," *Musica Disciplina* 53 (2003-2008): 99-119; Emanuel Winternitz, "Secular Music Practice in Sacred Art," *Early Music* 3.3 (1975): 220-6; Reinhold Hammerstein, *Die Musik der Engel: Untersuchungen zur Musikanschauung des Mittelalters* (Bern: Francke, 1962); James McKinnon, "Musical Instruments in Medieval Psalm Commentaries and Psalters."

⁷ I have found that while angelic beings sing the doxology in Ezekiel, Isaiah, and Revelations, they have musical instruments – citharas – only in the latter, which was not canonical in the Orthodox Church until the fourteenth century. Yet the Romanesque profusion of cithara-playing angels heralds the grip of this book on Western thought and art. Hymns and homilies typologically bound the Apocalypse with Christ's Resurrection, and the celestial liturgy of Revelation 4 with the Laudate Psalms.

⁸ Binski 2004, 158. Binski cited the Neoplatonic language of angelic joy set out in Pseudo-Dionysius's *Celestial Hierarchy* and in the liturgy—e.g., in the *Vere dignum*—to argue that Gothic musical angels were intended to have a specular role of reciprocal illumination where they embodied and projected the notion of collective joy and illuminated "the networks of symbolism and action in liturgy."

Καὶ τὸ φῶς ἐν τῇ σκοτίᾳ φαίνει: Color in Byzantine Gospel Lectionaries

Joseph R. Kopta, Temple University, Department of Art History

This paper will consider color in Greek manuscripts, specifically in Greek Gospel Lectionaries traceable to the Patriarchate of Constantinople, using the New York Jaharis Gospel Lectionary as a case study. The role of color in medieval art has been the subject of a growing number of studies in recent years, notably Liz James' *Light and Colour in Byzantine Art*, but has been limited almost exclusively to architecture and monumental works of art. This paper serves as an extension of James' study—limited in scope to color in the monumental programs of mosaics and, to a lesser extent, wall paintings—to include the paintings in Lectionary manuscripts, many of which date to the Middle Byzantine period or later. My methodology, first seen in James' work, will consider the relationship of color with Greek literature available to the Byzantines. Then, taking account of existing Greek color recipes and the few technical studies on manuscripts themselves, I will consider the relationship of color between the manuscript painting and the architectural interior where it was used.

As a tool celebrating the Divine Liturgy, the images in the Byzantine Gospel Lectionary participate in a dialogue with the architectural interior of the Byzantine church. The colors of the miniatures, depicting elaborate jeweled borders framing Gospel authors, shimmer and gleam with a variety of pigment materials. Greek ideas regarding color are unrelated to modern understandings of hue, but rather privilege value and texture. These understandings of varieties of texture and value see their actualization in manuscript painting itself. The painted decoration of Gospel figures, historiated initials, and gilded texts—achieved from a variety of material sources including insects, minerals, and organic dyes—participate in a dialogue with the architectural interior of Byzantine churches. The material colors in the pages extend and reflect the materials of church architecture itself in the heightened moment of the reading of the Gospel during the liturgy.

A Personal Message from Patriarch Photios to Emperor Basil I in the Paris Gregory
Courtney Tomaselli, Harvard University, Department of the History of Art and Architecture

The miniature on folio 435v of the ninth-century copy of the Homilies of Gregory of Nazianzus, Paris BN gr. 510, is at first glance a puzzling compilation. Prefacing the spurious letter of Gregory of Nazianzus to the monk Evagrius on the subject of the consubstantiality of the Trinity, it is composed in a quadripartite format unique amongst the forty-six full-page miniatures in the manuscript. Its four scenes relate to four stories from the Old Testament: Daniel in the lion's den, the three Hebrews in the fiery furnace, the prayer of Manasses, and Isaiah and Hezekiah on his deathbed.

In her book *Vision and Meaning in Ninth-Century Byzantium: Image as Exegesis in the Homilies of Gregory of Nazianzus*, Leslie Brubaker masterfully analyzed the ways in which the miniatures of the Paris Gregory related to their accompanying texts. Recognizing that many of the illuminated initials and *oboloi* intentionally highlighted specific portions of each text, and thus provided a key to a special interpretation of each miniature, Brubaker was able to provide a very strong case for the manuscript's patronage by the Patriarch Photios, relating each miniature and the peculiarities of its composition to the theological concerns or thoughts expressed by Photios in his writings. But the miniature on folio 435v was one of two left without interpretation in her book.

Following Brubaker's methodology, I will offer an interpretation of this miniature and the demarcated portions of its accompanying text. A consideration of each of the four biblical stories and a careful examination of the formal qualities of the miniature reveal an inherent order in which each of these four scenes should be read. This analysis highlights the common theme of holy royal advisors, and kings who repented their sins and reaped the rewards of following advice from such advisors. An investigation into the history of the patron and recipient of the manuscript, respectively the Patriarch Photios and the Emperor Basil I, suggests that this miniature is, in fact, one of the most important and personal of the manuscript.

When read in light of the events surrounding the Council of 867 and the Trinitarian beliefs of Photios, his subsequent exile and recall by Basil I, and the morally dubious manner in which Basil I assumed the throne, the meaning of the miniature and its relationship to the text it prefaces becomes clear. It contains an oblique yet very strong message to the emperor regarding orthodoxy and repentance. But most importantly, it speaks to the absolute necessity of the emperor trusting in, and not banishing, his spiritual advisor, and suggests the great rewards that might be gleaned from doing so. Through this miniature, Photios sought to communicate his own importance to the emperor and secure his position as patriarch and imperial advisor.

Vaticanus Graecus 752 and the Schism of 1054

Kelsey Eldridge, University of Washington, School of Art, Division of Art History

This paper examines the Eucharistic controversy that took place between the Byzantine East and Latin West in 1054 and its connection to the illuminated psalter, Vaticanus graecus 752. The Vat.gr.752 was produced in 1059 and is highly atypical among extant Byzantine psalters for both its catena and its depiction of anachronistic miniatures featuring uncommon religious figures. This paper uses the context of the schism of 1054 as a means of accounting for some of the psalter's peculiarities in text and image. The schism of 1054 erupted over Byzantine opposition to Latin use of unleavened bread (azyme) for the Eucharist and led to the mutual excommunications of the Byzantine Patriarch and three papal legates. Though most scholars have minimized its theological significance, this paper focuses on studies that reevaluate the lasting importance of the azyme issue for the Byzantine church. By reevaluating the theological importance of the schism, it can be argued that memory of the events of 1054 served as inspiration for many of the Vat.gr.752's curious and anachronistic miniatures.

Deification according to Maximos the Confessor and the Transcendence of Aristotelian Metaphysics

L. Joshua Salés, Fordham University, Department of Theology

The doctrine of deification or θέωσις is considered the trademark of Byzantine theology particularly and one of the most important aspects of Eastern Orthodox theology generally. Nevertheless, this doctrine is taken as a given by most scholars of Eastern Christianity, assuming that they know what the term means; needless to say, this unexamined presupposition has led to notable errors in interpreting the significance of the concept.

It is the burden of this paper to elucidate the meaning of deification by turning to one of Byzantium's most representative and sophisticated theologians, Maximos the Confessor. While we may take the rationality or the fact of deification for granted, explicating the term and establishing its credibility in opposition to other metaphysical systems was no easy task. Notably, the Aristotelian system of metaphysics describes a triadic structure in accordance with which the end of an essence is actualized through potencies inherent to it. The process that develops the potencies pertinent to an essence is known as realization and achieves its end (τέλος) by bringing such potencies to term. But Maximian metaphysics differ from Aristotelian metaphysics inasmuch as they hold that the end (τέλος) of a human (and all creation for that matter) is deification—borrowing directly from Aristotle the statement from the *Metaphysics* that “. . . the end is that for the sake of which all things are; it, however, is for the sake of nothing.” But humans do not have the natural potency in their being to actualize deification, or they would become God by nature. Already the Maximian system differs from the Aristotelian by distinguishing between something's actualization (ἐνέργεια) and something's end (τέλος). As such, humans may reach their actualization, that is, bring to term the fullness of their natural potencies and nevertheless not lay hold of their end.

A fundamental problematic arises as a result of holding the foregoing position. It appears to make humans unaccountable for the attainment of deification, that is, entirely uninvolved. In other words, the promotion to deification is given (or not) to humans irrespective of their activity or actuality (ἐνέργεια). But in a largely unprecedented development Maximos finds a way to transcend the Aristotelian metaphysics that would otherwise render his system incoherent. It is the human's task to attain a paradoxical passive actuality, whereby the human is able to render herself passible to suffering the divine energy of deification. This idea is well conveyed by Maximos' well-known doctrine of ἀντίδοσις σχετική (reciprocal relation), through which the human is able to be deified to the degree that God condescends to be humanized. Thus, while the actualization of deification is not a human activity, this does not imply the human has no part to play. Through virtue the human is able to render himself receptive to the divine energy and open to “The Word of God [who] wills always and in all things to actualize the mystery of his embodiment” (*Ambiguum* 7.22; PG 91.1084D).

Greek Clerical Appearance in anti-Byzantine Latin Polemic, late 11th-12th Centuries

Nicolas Kamas, University of Notre Dame, Medieval Institute

The infamous 11th-century legatine mission of Cardinal Humbert of Silva Candida, whatever its long-term implications for East-West Christian relations, sparked considerable interest in the Byzantine church among Latin ecclesiastical writers well into the next century. The vast majority of the literature, understandably, given the Western perspective, is anti-Greek in tone, and encompasses the genres of liturgical commentary, epistolary tracts, and out-and-out polemical treatises. While many of the issues at stake follow naturally from the context of the conflict between Cardinal Humbert and Patriarch Michael, involving principles of ecclesiology (the primacy of the Pope) or of liturgical practice (the use of leavened or unleavened bread), or even, especially by the 13th century, Trinitarian theology (the *filioque*, hearkening back to the much earlier conflict between the papacy and Patriarch Photios), a great deal of the material considers other (and, to a 21st-century audience, perhaps less important) matters. My proposed paper will examine accounts of the physical appearance of Greek clergy and the theological arguments derived from them in Latin polemics in the late 11th and 12th centuries.

I will consider two principle viewpoints in my paper. First, the Norman Anonymous, writing around the turn of the 12th century, references the appearance of Greek clerics briefly, and, remarkably for the time, in a neutral light. Reflecting his pro-Imperial stance in the Investiture Controversy, he uses the issue as part of his larger argument in favor of diversity in church practice. On the other hand, Hugo Eterianus, a theologian from Pisa living in Constantinople in the mid-late 12th century, mentions briefly in *De haeresibus quas Graeci in Latinos devolunt libri tres* that the practice of wearing beards is as much “in agreement with the Jews” as is the use of unleavened bread in the Eucharist, thereby defending Latin practices from the frequently-repeated Greek accusation. A chapter on the “Wicked habits of the Greeks (*Graecorum malae consuetudines*),” also by Hugo (or perhaps by his brother, Leo Tuscus, a translator for Manuel I Comnenus), and preserved as part of a longer, 13th-century treatise by an anonymous Dominican in Constantinople, clarifies his opinion. He strongly condemns the practice of wearing long hair, bringing to bear the full force of I Cor. 11:14, and later repeats his charge of Judaizing against bearded clerics, noting with apparent distaste that their beards are sodden by the end of the reception of communion.

Although both views are likely represented in other authors, the latter, condemning Greek practices, is undoubtedly the more common. The conflict between Pope and (Holy Roman) Emperor then raging in the West allowed the papalist party to make few concessions to practices seen as deviating from the Roman norm, and the physical appearance of Greek clergy, one of the more obvious points of difference between East and West, became fodder for polemic. The theological weight given to these seemingly benign differences in practice is fully consistent with other works of polemic, and it reflects a strong preoccupation, on both sides, with ritual practice, as opposed to correct doctrine.

An Evaluation of the Letters of George-Gennadios Scholarios to Members of the Ruling Elite in Fifteenth-Century Peloponnese

A. Kerim Kartal, Queen's University, Department of History

George-Gennadios Scholarios (ca. 1400-ca. 1472) is a late Byzantine intellectual and a man of religion. He was born a Byzantine and died an Ottoman, which highlights his witnessing a crucial transition period. Scholarios held different positions throughout his life: he was imperial secretary, official sermonist, general judge, monk, and in the end the first patriarch under Ottoman rule. His last position itself is adequate to recognize his importance. Scholarios left abundant literary material that is compiled in eight volumes yet not fully translated into a modern language. This study aims at evaluating six of his letters that were sent to various members of the ruling elite in the Peloponnese in the first half of the fifteenth century in light of fifteenth-century Peloponnesian politics; in a modest attempt to fill a gap in the relevant historiography. The addressees are Despot Theodore II, Alexios Laskaris (Philanthropenos), Despot Constantine, Despot Demetrios, and Manuel Raoul Oises. They are either people who could assist Scholarios leave Constantinople and start a new career in the Peloponnese, or anti-Unionists like him with whom Scholarios felt the need to cooperate against the Union of the Orthodox and the Catholic churches. In the end he neither had the opportunity to leave Constantinople for the Peloponnese, nor could he hinder the eminent Union, which came about in 1452, months before the fall of Constantinople.

Encountering the Face: The Mandylion at the Church of the Panagia tou Arakou at Lagoudhera

Leah Marangos, Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey, Department of Art History

The image of Christ's face impressed upon a white fringed cloth suspends over the extended apse of the late twelfth century church of the Panagia tou Arakou at Lagoudhera in Cyprus. The image replicates the Mandylion relic stored in the Pharos Chapel in Istanbul. The relic was believed to be an *acheropoitas* image, one made not by human hands, but when Christ impressed his face upon a cloth as a gift to the King of Edessa. In the tenth century, the relic, and its copy, the Keramikon, were transferred to the Pharos Chapel in Constantinople. The inclusion of the Mandylion and its location in the apse of a provincial church such as Lagoudhera would have been an anomaly to the contemporaneous viewer. The patron of the church, Leon Authentes, initiated the alteration of the church decoration at Lagoudhera in 1192, with several inscriptions asserting his dedication and hope for salvation placed alongside images of the Virgin and the Keramikon. This paper seeks to explain the reasons for the alteration and the incorporation of the Mandylion icon into the decorative program, as well as to account for the appropriate location above the apse. I argue that the Mandylion serves as a signifier to Constantinople and the Patriarchate during the transformation of the cultural landscape of Cyprus, as a result of the Crusades. The Mandylion along with the Keramikon, substantiates the role of images within Byzantine society and the use of images as substitutes for tangible relics. Furthermore, I intend to explore the dialogue the Mandylion and the Keramikon have with each other and the surrounding icons in the church, enhancing the semiotics of these two images.

Physical and Spiritual Protection at the Monastery of St. Katherine, Sinai

Kaelin M. Jewell, Temple University, Department of Art History

The Sinai Peninsula, a wedge-shaped piece of land that connects Africa to the Near East, conjures images of an unforgiving wilderness and extreme isolation. For the early Christian pilgrim, Sinai functioned as a place where the heavenly and earthly realms met; the austerity of its rugged landscape had a sacred dimension, as it was believed that in these mountains biblical heroes like Moses and Elijah walked and communicated directly with God. With the rise of monasticism during late antiquity, monumental architecture gave expression to this idea, most visibly at the sixth-century Monastery of the Burning Bush, today known as the Monastery of St. Katherine. Rising to a seemingly indescribable height behind the southern wall of St. Katherine's, the Sinai massif, a conglomeration of mountain peaks, dwarfs the monastic complex and renders it visually and to some extent physically exposed to the surrounding landscape. In the sixth century, this vulnerability is tempered as Prokopios tells us that Justinian ordered the construction of a massive fortification wall. (*The Buildings*, Book V: viii, 9) The tenth-century historian Eutychios, however, reminds us that aerial assaults could be launched from the adjacent mountains into the monastery. (*PG* 1863: cols. 1071-1072) How effective, then, could this wall be against a coordinated attack? Nevertheless, the wall continued to function as a material expression of protection—a notion that, I argue, is paralleled by spiritual protection in the form of a small intramural chapel on the southern side of the complex.

This chapel, built within the fabric of the Justinianic fortification wall, consists of a narrow barrel-vaulted room with two main niches: a semi-circular one to the east and a rectangular one to the west. The entire interior, except the floor, is covered in a skin of late antique painted decoration. Although textual sources for the monastery are rich, none refer to this chapel. Furthermore, scholars have limited their discussions of the monument to brief descriptions of its architectural plan and decorative program. This paper seeks to understand the diminutive chapel as it relates to the monastery and to the surrounding landscape. Moreover, I argue that the proliferation of crosses in the interior and on the exterior of the space could point to the chapel's role in adding an apotropaic aspect to the wall, which thus fuses sacred and physical protection.

The Infirmary and Space for the Ill in the Monasteries of Late Antiquity
Tyler Wolford, Koç University, Department of Archaeology and History of Art

The monastic movement of Late Antiquity radically altered their newly inhabited landscapes, transforming, as various scholars such as Derwas Chitty have illustrated, in the words of St. Athanasius, “the desert into a city.” In these new cities, the monastic leaders did not ignore the needs of the sick among them. In many cases the ill were allowed a less restricted diet, such as are dictated in the writings of St. Pachomius and St. Shenoute, both in Egypt (Praec. 40-42; Canon 5, XS 325). Many monasteries were also equipped with an infirmary, delineating a specific place for treating illness in the monastery. While they share the same medical tradition, these infirmaries were distinct from the hospitals that monasteries often financed.

A few infirmaries have been tentatively identified archaeologically, including those of the Monastery of Apa Jeremiah in Egypt and the Monastery of St. Euthymius in the Judean Desert. The modern refectory of Mar Saba has been associated with its ancient infirmary. The infirmaries mentioned in literary sources, however, are far more numerous. They range from those of the monasteries of the Pachomius, characterized in the fourth century as the refectory of the ill, to the Monastery of Seridus in Gaza, which had a medical library in the sixth century (Praec. 42; Corr. 327). The information even comes from monks running the infirmaries, such as St. Dorotheus, but also St. Anastasius of Sinai at St. Catherine’s Monastery in Sinai, writing in the seventh century (Narr. I.3). While the infirmary was a staple part of many Late Antique coenobitic monasteries, they were often added to larger lavra monasteries, such as the Great Lavra in the fifth century (V.Sab. 32.117). Originally the sick were brought to the main church of a lavra, where a bed was maintained (Apoph.Pat. Alph. Arsenius 36). These could be represented archaeologically, albeit in a secular setting, in the town church of the city of Pharan in Sinai, dedicated the doctor-saints Cosmas and Damian. It contained a kitchen within the church for the preparation of food and medication.

The infirmaries and locations for the sick within monasteries should be seen as distinct from the monastery’s guesthouse and charities, which could also serve the sick. The later are especially important because of the role they would play in the development of the later Byzantine hospital. While the words used for these two buildings usually overlap indiscriminately, they tend to be separated in the monastery based on their clientele and location. The infirmary was for the monks of the community. When outsiders come to the infirmary of the Monastery of Seridus, St. Dorotheus asked the abbot if he should give them medication (Corr. 313). Conversely, the hospital and guesthouse were usually placed outside the monastery proper and usually served those who came from outside the monastery. While both institutions have specific instances of sophisticated Late Antique medicine, delineating the infirmary and separating it from the hospital allows a more nuanced understanding of how medicine and healing operated in these early monasteries.

Jewelry and the Morality of Adornment in the Medieval Eastern Mediterranean

Elizabeth Williams, NYU, Institute of Fine Arts

Studies on Byzantine and early Islamic jewelry tend to foreground formal analyses to discern trends and to identify the origins of pieces in specific locales or workshops. Such an approach focused on chronology and attribution does not, however, address broader questions related to jewelry and its wear. In my dissertation, I attempt to address these larger issues through a thematic structure. This approach has allowed me to move away from analyzing jewelry strictly in terms of its production, and to situate it instead within broader cultural discussions about individual, family, community, and sectarian identities.

To show an example of this thematically driven approach, my conference paper will take up one theme: the intersection of women's jewelry with moral debates about the display of wealth in the Byzantine and Islamic eastern Mediterranean. Bodies adorned in glittering gold and silver jewelry appear as common tropes in Byzantine and Islamic theological and moral debates about the merits and dangers of wealth. In these discussions, the adorned female body becomes a microcosm for moral concerns about wealth and its display. This paper will argue that the female body featured as a battleground common to many regional traditions, a legacy inherited from the moralistic texts of the Roman world. Case studies here will show how women's adornment could be viewed both in negative terms (for instance, in the trope of the bejeweled harlot) and positive ones (as in depictions of female allegories of wealth wearing jewelry). The paper will show that many of these late antique traditions continued through the Islamic period, where similar discussions about adornment's negative and positive connotations played out. These include, for example, discussions about the dangers of *tabarruj* ("display of beauty"), or hadiths and legal traditions about the merits of showing wealth considered ordained by God. By focusing on texts, objects, and visual representations, this paper serves as a case study in exploring how a contextual approach to jewelry can reveal much about the complexities of medieval attitudes to wealth and its display.

Recalling the Female “Intellectual” in Sarcophagi Narrative Scenes of the Long Late Antiquity

Alzahraa K. Ahmed, NYU, Institute of Fine Arts

The neo-Pythagorean Alexandrian author Bryson’s perhaps second-century text *Oikonomikos* (The Management of Man’s Household) influenced ideas on organization of the household economy in late antiquity and has come to us largely through a ninth-century Arabic translation (*Tadbir al-Rajul li-Manzilihi*). The Arabic phrase used in the text for “correct of mind” -- *sahihat al-‘aql* -- connotes the achievement and sustainment of intelligence, education, and knowledge. Its use by Bryson and intellectuals who adapted his work exemplifies views of women as partners in managing the household during antiquity. Women’s intellect was key, and emphasis was put on their presence, virtuosity, education, and eloquence. Evidence of this point extracted from Bryson’s text seems to be supported by representations from late antiquity appearing to show female intellectuals in ways that suggest they were revered and respected. Looking at a set of representations in funerary monuments from a range of locales between the third and sixth centuries, though with a focus on a sixth-century sarcophagus fragment attributed to Constantinople, I explore the different ways in which females appeared as “intellectuals.” I also inquire into their range of references and pose the question of whether the notion of females possessing intellect was a broadly accepted ideal of femininity. If so, I ask how this point changes our understanding of the construction of femininity in late antique cultures.

Byzantine Models in Lombard Jewellery: Materials from Castel Trosino and Nocera Umbra (Italy)

Valentina De Pasca, University of Milan, Early Medieval Archaeology

Studying the materials brought to light from the graves in the Early Medieval cemeteries in Castel Trosino and Nocera Umbra (both necropolis located in central Italy) leads to a reflection concerning the jewellery handcraft found during the archaeological campaigns which took place at the end of the XIXth Century. Although to date jewellery has been studied only superficially, it could be the starting point for a multidisciplinary analysis which would go beyond a simple study of the production in the early Lombard age. It could in fact throw light on the trading of luxury objects and on the circulation of typological and stylistic models strongly influenced by the byzantine culture.

Manufacturing and use of jewellery for personal adornment was typical of the German people who attributed a primary role to precious objects to highlight their social status. This habit emerges in a relevant way studying Castel Trosino and Nocera Umbra grave materials where the ranks of the tombs are clearly evidenced, as well as the difference in the quality of the jewels produced of German and Byzantine tastes which evolved in parallel without damaging each other.

Even though the refined manufacture and the precious materials evident in the Byzantine objects would appeal to the Lombard people, it is also true that imitating the “fashion of Constantinople” was accompanied by a clear allusion of the wealth and power of the Byzantine court. It is of little importance that the sophistication of the artifacts in the Byzantine style found in the cemeteries of Castel Trosino and Nocera Umbra were not up to the level of the production of the workshops in Constantinople, what constituted a relevant factor was the call to a clear model belonging to a well-formal stylistic language easily decoded and equipped with its own symbology.

This study wants to show how the Byzantine influence clearly characterized some of the Lombard jewels brought to light in the two central Italy necropolis, to compare them with contemporary Costantinopolitan productions and to highlight how byzantine cultural guidelines reached not only the empire’s territories more sensitive to that kind of cultural influence (e.g. Syria and Egypt) but also all those territories and societies with different customs and traditions which were unable to resist the charms aesthetic and symbolic of Byzantium.

Painting Cultural Scars: A Look at Post-Byzantine Paintings through the Trauma Model

Mateusz J. Ferens, University of California, Riverside, History of Art Department

The years 1204 and 1453 both brought cultural and societal changes to Byzantium. Their impact on Greek identity resulted in collective trauma that manifested itself in different ways on certain groups of the former Byzantine society. Furthermore, a reaction to this trauma, whether in a repressed or an expressed form, is reflected within the art of the Greek people.

In my paper I explore the model of cultural trauma and collective identity as proposed by J. C. Alexander and N. J. Smelser (2004), and I apply this model to the reactions of the people of Greece living under Ottoman rule, the Greeks living under Venetian rule, and the Greek Orthodox Church. I base my arguments on examples of post-Byzantine art in the form of icons, and specifically on the hybridity of the iconography of Crete in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.

I argue that the fall of Constantinople contributed toward the fracturing of Byzantine society in a way that created rifts within different socio-political groups. Essentially, these groups employed very different ways of coping with the trauma induced by the Ottoman occupation. The collective trauma itself propagated the notion of Hellenism and an eventual unification of the Greek people. This would later lead to the movement for Greek independence. However, it is the loyalties felt among the Greeks immediately following the fall of Constantinople, and their divisions, that are dissected in this paper. By looking at the icons produced during this time, it is possible to gain an understanding of the causes and the emotions within the fractured groups of Greek post-Byzantine Society.

Imperial Competition and Cultural Constructs: The Empires of Nicaea and Thessaloniki in the Late Byzantine World

Grant Schrama, Queen's University, Department of History

The focus of my paper is on the competition between the Kingdom of Thessaloniki and the Empire of Nicaea as legitimate claimants to the imperial throne of Constantinople after its sack in 1204 by the Franks. More specifically, I will be examining how the city of Thessaloniki became the centre of the Greek successor states in Europe, as well as the competition that arose between the leaders of Thessaloniki and Nicaea for supreme authority over these Byzantine territories. As well, I will be discussing how and why Thessaloniki became the place in Europe for launching a campaign against the Latins to reconquer Constantinople in comparison to the Empire of Nicaea. Throughout my essay, I will be exploring such general themes as imperial ideology, political and cultural identities, and the process of state formation in the late Byzantine world. I will be consulting such contemporary writers as Niketas Choniates, Michael Choniates and Geoffrey Villehardouin for this paper, while also exploring the works of such modern historians as Anthony Kaldellis, Dimiter Angelov and Michael Angold.

My essay will argue that Thessaloniki became the centre of Greek resurgence and opposition to Latin suzerainty, but only after 1224 and only in Greece. It was after this date that it began to be a serious competitor to the Nicaean Empire, yet the two cities acted together as centres of Hellenism and Greek culture in the thirteenth century. Thessaloniki was unique in comparison to the rest of Greece, as it became the most important city for the launching of a reconquest of Constantinople from the Latins. Its status as the second capital city of the Byzantine Empire continued throughout the Frankish occupation and made it a distinct identity from the other regions in Greece. For both Thessaloniki and Nicaea, geographic location and the figures claiming power there played a role in the rise of it as a successor Greek state. With regards to Thessaloniki, it rose in prominence starkly after it was conquered by the Greek Theodore Doukas, while for Nicaea its significance was solidified by its location and its founder, Theodore Laskaris. I will also argue that the Frankish regime in Thessaloniki was not a serious imperial candidate. Instead, I will propose that Boniface of Montferrat was more concerned with establishing suzerainty over all of Greece instead of capturing Constantinople, despite the fact that he was a candidate for emperor shortly after the city fell in 1204. His plan to dominate the entire Greek mainland was cut short though by his death at the hands of the Bulgars.

Revisiting Iconoclasm: Figural Imagery as an Instrument of State Politics in Byzantium and Early Islam

Eric Medawar, University of Connecticut, Classics and Ancient Mediterranean Studies

Scholars have offered a number of explanations for the emergence of Byzantine iconoclasm, including medieval class struggle, reaction to the excessive use of figural art in the church, and administrative responses to the martial victories of the Arab forces under the direction of the Rashidun and Umayyad caliphs. One of the more controversial theories concerning the origin of Byzantine iconoclasm suggests that early Islam inoculated Byzantium with aniconic sentiment by forcing Byzantine Christians to consider the association of iconolatry with idolatry. The origins of Byzantine iconoclasm nevertheless remain obscure, and, as Peter Brown observed (1973), “the Iconoclast controversy is in the grip of a crisis of over-explanation.” In stark contrast, the aniconism of Islam during its formative stages is an almost uncontested fact, and closer scrutiny of the phenomenon is lacking in the literature on the subject. Despite the early report of Muḥammad cleansing the Ka‘bah of idols, however, figurative representation appears in descriptions of mosques (Wāsiṭ), in the capitals forming the *mihṛāb* of the Al-Aqsa Mosque, and other sacred structures dating from the pre-Marwanid period.

This paper will revisit the issue of figural representation in Byzantine Christianity and early Islam, but from a different angle, by focusing on caliphate-imperial relations (*ca.* 692-723) as a catalyst for both Byzantine iconoclasm and Islamic aniconism. My contention is that, beginning with Justinian II’s institution of gold solidi bearing the bust of Christ, a series of tit-for-tat exchanges occurred between Byzantine emperors and Umayyad caliphs that culminated in a “contest of images” which discouraged figurative representation in religious settings. In time, the Edict of Yazīd (722/723) and Council of Hieria (754) attempted to ratify the state-sponsored aniconism of the Marwanid caliphs and iconoclasm of the Byzantine emperors, respectively. Thus, the aniconic monuments of the Marwanid era, such as the Dome of the Rock (692/698?) and Great Mosque of Damascus (712) can be compared with the iconoclastic program of Leo III and Constantine V (e.g., the aniconic *miliaresion* coin struck in 720, et al). Relying on data gathered from Umayyad and Byzantine numismatics, Arabic papyrology, pre-Marwanid mosaics and sacred architecture, imperial correspondence, ḥadīth studies, and other documentary evidence, this paper seeks to demonstrate that official attitudes of the period (*ca.* 692-723) toward figurative representation firmly served as instruments of imperial politics. While shedding light on their origins, this paper will also attempt to establish a connection between Byzantine iconoclasm and the aniconism of early Islam.

Akritas or Emperor? An Examination of the Military Career of John Tzimiskes

James Gilmer, Cardiff University, Department of History

This paper will evaluate the military career of the Emperor John I, both prior to and following his accession to the imperial throne. This paper will draw upon research culled from Byzantine historical chronicles – primarily that of Leo the Deacon and John Skylitzes – to demonstrate John’s compliance, or lack thereof, with accepted Byzantine military procedures. “Accepted Byzantine military procedures” will be defined vis-à-vis the recommendations provided in the *Taktika* of Leo the Wise and the *Praecepta Militaria* of Nikephoros Phokas. Where there is deviance between accepted practice and John’s actions, this paper will attempt to reconcile the differences observed as due to a combination of John’s personality and Anatolian upbringing. To that end, this paper will also make use of the epic poem *Digenes Akrites* to demonstrate the rather different mindset of the Anatolian hierarchy in relation to the established government in Constantinople.

The Byzantine Nachleben of Aeschylus

Matthew Keil, Fordham University, Department of Classics

The history of the reception of Aeschylus' works during the Byzantine period is one of paradox. On the one hand, of the three great tragedians, Aeschylus was, in Byzantine times, both the least popular and perhaps the least well known. Yet on the other hand, there was in some quarters undoubted interest in his work, and that on a more or less continual basis throughout the entire span of Byzantine history. This interest in turn not only manifested itself in the preservation of the seven plays by Aeschylus which still survive, but also in the influence that he had on such unique works as the *Christus Patiens* (Χριστὸς Πάσχων), and the *Katomyomachia* (Κατομυομαχία). The most important Byzantine achievement for Aeschylus however, lies in the work of the late-Byzantine scholar Demetrios Triclinios and his annotated edition of the *Agamemnon*, along with several other works by Aeschylus. Though called by the greatest classical scholar of all time, Ulrich Willamowitz, "the first modern scholar of literature," Triclinios' work has only recently begun to be appreciated by modern scholars in the west, in proportion as the achievements of Byzantium, in general, have grown in increasing recognition over and against prevailing nineteenth-century disdain for the period.

All of these issues are discussed, as well as both a consideration of Aeschylus' place in the Byzantine educational curriculum, and references to him as they are found in certain Greek patristic authors.

The Interpretation of John 19:34 in Late Antique Byzantine Thought

Jonathan M. Reck, Dallas Theological Seminary, New Testament Studies

The interpretation of the piercing of Jesus's side as depicted in John 19:34 takes on vigorous and dynamic developments in Western and Eastern traditions. The single verse has historically been drawn upon in debate on Christ's humanity and heavily shaped sacramental views, while its textual variants have been the topic of great controversy at points of ecclesiastical history. In the West, among the several streams of interpretation we find the verse aiding Irenaeus in his response to Marcionism as well as Augustine's view of Jesus reopening the doors of Paradise that the first Adam had shut (thus following the variant ἤνοιξεν [Lat., *aperuit*] instead of ἔνυξεν). In the East, we find profound treatments by Ephrem on the sacramental significance of the blood and water issuing from Jesus, the two being symbolic of the waters of baptism and the new covenant. Even for the medieval Muslim theologian 'Abd al-Jabbar, the spearing of Jesus's side was viewed to have taken place *before* dying, a view that reflects what may be a widespread influence of a major variant reading involving a likely textual insertion of John 19:34 into Matthew 27:49. The diversity of interpretations of John 19:34 makes for an intriguing study of the interpretive development of the verse within Byzantine thought. The purpose of this 20-minute paper will be to trace the larger developments of the interpretation of John 19:34 throughout Byzantine late antique centuries, particularly focusing on its sacramental significance evident in liturgical and homiletic materials and iconography.

Maximus Planudes and Boethius' Byzantine reception: Βίος Βοηθίου

Paul A. Brazinski, The Catholic University of America, School of Theology and Religious Studies, Church History

In the waning years of his life, Boethius wrote his famous *De Consolatione Philosophiae*, where the consoling Philosophy helps Boethius deal with his unfortunate imprisonment. Although modern scholarship debates whether or not he was a Christian, and thus, a martyr, Boethius was celebrated in his post-mortem years as a Christian saint. His reception was influential in the medieval period and his work circulated widely. Medieval Christians saw theological implications in his *Consolatio* and the work stood as the only Aristotle that some would ever read in their lifetimes. Others, such as Alfred the Great (d. 899), Notker Labeo (d. 1022), Jean de Meun (d. 1305), and Elizabeth I (d. 1603) wrote translations of the *De Consolatione Philosophiae* in their respective vernacular languages. Moreover, other important medieval figures, such as Aquinas (d. 1274), wrote commentaries and notes on Boethius' works. Therefore, given the immense amount of literature on Boethius' reception in the Middle Ages, it only makes sense that a comparative amount of modern scholarship also exists on the same topic, which for the most part is true.

Kaylor and Phillips' 2012 work is the latest word on Boethius' reception in the Middle Ages. Here, as elsewhere in other works on the topic, the entries discuss Boethius' reception in the West in terms of translations, commentaries, and his influence on the intellectual culture. Few works focus on the eastern influence of Boethius, which is the primary focus of my essay. In this paper, I will showcase the eastern reception of Boethius. I will first set the stage in discussing the possible reception of Boethius in the East by looking at Planudes'

Βίος Βοηθίου, (*The Life of Boethius*), which prefaced his translation of Boethius' *Consolatio*. Maximus Planudes (Μάξιμος Πλανούδης; d. 1305) wrote the first Greek translation of Boethius' *De Consolatione Philosophiae*, which appeared in the thirteenth-century; he also provided his own accompanying scholia. Megas demonstrates that Planudes' *Βίος Βοηθίου* is based on Cassiodorus' *Life of Boethius*. I will build upon Megas' discussion, arguing that Planudes' *Βίος Βοηθίου* is a product of the Palaeologan Renaissance, which reflects Byzantine- and Eastern-centric propaganda. I also argue that Planudes' style reflects his audience. Then, I will discuss the known eastern reception of Boethius as displayed in the manuscript tradition. I will discern what facts about Boethius' life and his *Consolatio* made its way to the Byzantine Empire.